

1 HANSON BRIDGETT LLP  
2 KURT A. FRANKLIN, SBN 172715  
kfranklin@hansonbridgett.com  
3 LISA M. POOLEY, SBN 168737  
lpooley@hansonbridgett.com  
4 SAMANTHA WOLFF, SBN 240280  
swolff@hansonbridgett.com  
425 Market Street, 26th Floor  
5 San Francisco, California 94105  
Telephone: (415) 777-3200  
6 Facsimile: (415) 541-9366

7 HANSON BRIDGETT LLP  
TYSON M. SHOWER, SBN 190375  
tshower@hansonbridgett.com  
LANDON D. BAILEY, SBN 240236  
lbailey@hansonbridgett.com  
500 Capitol Mall, Suite 1500  
10 Sacramento, California 95814  
Telephone: (916) 442-3333  
11 Facsimile: (916) 442-2348

12 OTTEN LAW, PC  
VICTOR OTTEN, SBN 165800  
vic@ottenlawpc.com  
KAVITA TEKCHANDANI, SBN 234873  
14 kavita@ottenlawpc.com  
3620 Pacific Coast Highway, #100  
15 Torrance, California 90505  
Telephone: (310) 378-8533  
16 Facsimile: (310) 347-4225

17 Attorneys for Plaintiffs  
CORY SPENCER, DIANA MILENA  
18 REED, and COASTAL PROTECTION  
RANGERS, INC.

19

20 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
21 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA, WESTERN DIVISION**  
22

23 CORY SPENCER, an individual;  
24 DIANA MILENA REED, an  
individual; and COASTAL  
25 PROTECTION RANGERS, INC., a  
California non-profit public benefit  
26 corporation,

27 Plaintiffs.

28 CASE NO. 2:16-cv-02129-SJO (RAOx)  
**DECLARATION OF KURT A.  
FRANKLIN IN OPPOSITION TO  
DEFENDANTS CITY OF PALOS  
VERDES ESTATES AND CHIEF OF  
POLICE JEFF KEPLEY'S MOTION  
FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT OR, IN  
THE ALTERNATIVE, SUMMARY  
ADJUDICATION**

Case No. 2:16-cv-02129-SJO (RAOx)

DECL. OF K. FRANKLIN IN OPP. TO DEFTS. CITY OF PALOS VERDES ESTATES AND CHIEF OF POLICE  
JEFF KEPLEY'S MOT. FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT OR, IN THE ALTERNATIVE, SUMMARY ADJUD.

1

v.

2  
3 LUNADA BAY BOYS; THE  
4 INDIVIDUAL MEMBERS OF THE  
5 LUNADA BAY BOYS, including but  
not limited to SANG LEE, BRANT  
6 BLAKEMAN, ALAN JOHNSTON  
AKA JALIAN JOHNSTON,  
7 MICHAEL RAE PAPAYANS,  
ANGELO FERRARA, FRANK  
8 FERRARA, CHARLIE FERRARA,  
9 and N. F.; CITY OF PALOS VERDES  
10 ESTATES; CHIEF OF POLICE JEFF  
KEPLEY, in his representative  
11 capacity; and DOES 1-10,

12

Defendants.

13

14

15

I, Kurt A. Franklin, declare as follows:

16

17 1. I am an attorney duly admitted to practice before this Court. I am a  
partner with Hanson Bridgett LLP, attorneys of record for Plaintiffs CORY  
18 SPENCER, DIANA MILENA REED, and COASTAL PROTECTION RANGERS,  
19 INC. I have personal knowledge of the facts set forth herein, except as to those  
stated on information and belief and, as to those, I am informed and believe them to  
20 be true. If called as a witness, I could and would competently testify to the matters  
21 stated herein.

22

23 2. Attached hereto as Exhibit 1 is a true and correct copy of select  
excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Steve Barber** taken in the instant action on  
24 June 22, 2017.

25

26 3. Attached hereto as Exhibit 2 is a true and correct copy of select  
excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Tony Best** (Person Most Knowledgeable for  
27

28

Judge: Hon. S. James Otero  
Date: September 5, 2017  
Time: 10:00 a.m.  
Crtrm.: 10C

Complaint Filed: March 29, 2016  
Trial Date: November 7, 2017

1 Defendant City of Palos Verdes Estates) taken in the instant action on July 21, 2017.

2       4. Attached hereto as Exhibit 3 is a true and correct copy of select  
3 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Defendant Brant Blakeman** taken in the  
4 instant action on November 21, 2016.

5       5. Attached hereto as Exhibit 4 is a true and correct copy of select  
6 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Ken Claypool** taken in the instant action on  
7 June 13, 2017.

8       6. Attached hereto as Exhibit 5 is a true and correct copy of select  
9 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Anton Dahlerbruch** taken in the instant  
10 action on November 18, 2016.

11       7. Attached hereto as Exhibit 6 is a true and correct copy of select  
12 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Anton Dahlerbruch (Person Most  
13 Knowledgeable for Defendant City of Palos Verdes Estates)** taken in the instant  
14 action on July 13, 2017.

15       8. Attached hereto as Exhibit 7 is a true and correct copy of select  
16 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Defendant Charles Ferrara** taken in the  
17 instant action on July 7, 2017.

18       9. Attached hereto as Exhibit 8 is a true and correct copy of select  
19 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Defendant Chief of Police Jeff Kepley**  
20 taken in the instant action on October 10, 2016.

21       10. Attached hereto as Exhibit 9 is a true and correct copy of select  
22 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Sheri Repp Loadsman (Person Most  
23 Knowledgeable for Defendant City of Palos Verdes Estates)** taken in the instant  
24 action on July 13, 2017.

25       11. Attached hereto as Exhibit 10 is a true and correct copy of select  
26 redacted excerpts of the deposition transcript of **N.F.** taken in the instant action on  
27 July 6, 2017.

1       12. Attached hereto as Exhibit 11 is a true and correct copy of select  
2 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Catherine Placek** taken in the instant action  
3 on June 23, 2017.

4       13. Attached hereto as Exhibit 12 is a true and correct copy of select  
5 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Plaintiff Diana Milena Reed** taken in the  
6 instant action on October 24 and 25, 2016.

7       14. Attached hereto as Exhibit 13 is a true and correct copy of select  
8 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Plaintiff Cory Spencer** taken in the instant  
9 action on October 11, 2016.

10      15. Attached hereto as Exhibit 14 is a true and correct copy of select  
11 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Christopher Taloa** taken in the instant  
12 action on January 5, 2017.

13      16. Exhibit 15 is a true and correct redacted copy of Defendant Alan  
14 Johnston's Cell Record Detail. An unredacted copy of Exhibit 15 is submitted with  
15 Plaintiffs' Application for Leave to File Under Seal.

16      17. Attached hereto as Exhibit 16 is a true and correct copy of a transcript  
17 of selected excerpts from the DVD of Swell Life of Browne and Peter McCollum.  
18 The DVD is being lodged separately with the Court. I caused my office to  
19 transcribe statements made by Peter McCollum in the documentary.

20      18. My co-counsel in this matter, Victor Otten, is lodging a true and correct  
21 copy of the documentary The Swell Life (2001), Darren McInerney, Director, which  
22 documents surfing localism. A true and correct copy of this video, bates  
23 PLTF002249, is Exhibit 34 to this declaration and is lodged with the court. *See*  
24 Plaintiffs' Notice of Lodging. In particular, Plaintiffs are lodging excerpts from the  
25 Swell Life video showing declarations against interest made by Peter McCollum and  
26 Chief Timm Browne as identified more specifically in Paragraphs 19 and 20.

27      19. Lunada Bay local Peter McCollum on video shown in the documentary

1 (5:14 seconds to 5:31, and 15:05 to 15:19) Witness Geoffrey Hagens observed Mr.  
2 McCollum on this day, and authenticates the video excerpts accurately portray what  
3 happened that day. *See* Hagens Decl. ¶¶ 3, 6, and 7. Further, I caused my office to  
4 transcribe what Mr. McCollum says in the video, which is: "He won't surf here  
5 again, though, got it? Got it? You got that, son? You got it? Hey, hey, I'm touching  
6 nobody. Nothing. But you won't surf here again, boy. You won't surf here again.  
7 Fuck that, fuck you guys! I've been here too long to take this shit." (5:14 seconds to  
8 5:31). And, "How many guys are at Malibu right now, huh? How many fucking  
9 guys are at Malibu, huh? (I don't know.) Did you ever notice we've done a good  
10 thing here, haven't we? It's pretty nice and pretty, huh? (It's beautiful.) It's beautiful!  
11 And so when you exploit it, we'll thank you." (15:05 to 15:19).

12 20. Lunada Bay Chief of Police Timm Browne, is also depicted in the  
13 documentary. I caused my office to transcribe what Chief Browne says in the video,  
14 which is: "In 1995, there were some incidents actually provoked by outsiders who  
15 brought news crews with them. Umm, they had it planned and then provoked  
16 incidents that are actually captured on local television news spots. People here do  
17 not like outsiders in general. Umm, I mean, they pay a price to live here. Umm,  
18 they have beautiful views of the ocean from most of the homes in the City. Umm,  
19 so, uh, they are protective of their community as a whole, umm, I mean surfers or  
20 non-surfers." (13:44 to 14:39) And, "The people that live in and around that area and  
21 then surf there do not want pictures taken because it is a gem. They don't want  
22 people to know where it specifically it is. If everybody knows where it is, then we'll  
23 have all 8 million surfers from Los Angeles in that little tiny cove?" (14:37 to 15:04)  
24 During the deposition of Tony Best, I showed him this same video and he was able  
25 to confirm it was Timm Brown, whom he had worked under. *See* PAMF 163, and  
26 Best Depo. 124:22-25, 125:1-25, 126:1-25, 127:1-13.

27 21. From The Los Angeles Times Website, I downloaded the following  
28

1 articles, true and correct copies of which are attached as Exhibits A and B to  
2 Plaintiffs' Request for Judicial Notice, as specifically detailed in Paragraphs 22 and  
3 23.

4       22. The Los Angeles Times, July 5, 1991, Tim Waters, "The Hazards of  
5 Surfing Lunada Bay: Peninsula: Outsiders run the risk of being pelted with rocks or  
6 having their vehicles vandalized. The locals offer no apologies for treating the  
7 public area as if it was their own." This article is available online through The Los  
8 Angeles Times website at: [http://articles.latimes.com/1991-07-05/local/me-1657\\_1\\_lunada-bay](http://articles.latimes.com/1991-07-05/local/me-1657_1_lunada-bay);

10       23. The Los Angeles Times, May 8, 1995, Tony Perry, Turf Wars Spoil  
11 Sanctity of Southland Surf Beaches : Violence: Popularity leads to crowding.  
12 Charges that one group attacked outsiders highlight the problem." This article is  
13 available online through The Los Angeles Times website at:  
[http://articles.latimes.com/1995-05-08/news/mn-63795\\_1\\_lunada-bay](http://articles.latimes.com/1995-05-08/news/mn-63795_1_lunada-bay).

15       24. From Bureau of Justice Statistics, I downloaded a December 29, 2016  
16 report by Todd D. Minton and Zhen Zeng, Ph.D. from the Bureau of Justice  
17 Statistics entitled "Jail Inmates In 2015." This report is available online through the  
18 Bureau of Justice Statistics website at:

19 <https://www.bjs.gov/index.cfm?ty=pbdetail&iid=5872> A true and correct copy of  
20 this report is attached as Exhibits C to Plaintiffs' Request for Judicial Notice.

21       25. My co-counsel in this matter, Victor Otten, is lodging a true and correct  
22 copy video taken by Defendant Brant Blakeman on February 13, 2016 [Bates No.  
23 BB081 and BB082]. I have transcribed the audio from this video, a true and correct  
24 copy of which is as attached as Exhibit 17, to this Declaration. *See* Plaintiffs' Notice  
25 of Lodging.

26       26. News correspondent Frank Stoltze of AirTalk Radio Los Angeles,  
27 KPCC 89.3, interviewed Defendant Chief of Police Jeff Kepley regarding localism

1 in Lunada Bay. The radio interview is titled "How surfer 'gang mentality' is keeping  
2 people off some SoCal beaches," and dated July 17, 2015. The full radio interview  
3 is available online through Southern California Public Radio (SCPR) at:  
4 [http://www.scpr.org/programs/airtalk/2015/07/17/43700/how-surfer-gang-mentality-](http://www.scpr.org/programs/airtalk/2015/07/17/43700/how-surfer-gang-mentality-is-keeping-people-off-so/)  
5 [is-keeping-people-off-so/](http://www.scpr.org/programs/airtalk/2015/07/17/43700/how-surfer-gang-mentality-is-keeping-people-off-so/). I have downloaded this radio interview for use in this  
6 lawsuit. I caused my office to transcribe what Chief Kepley says in the radio  
7 interview (2:57 through 7:40). Next, during the deposition of the City's PMK, Tony  
8 Best, who has worked with Chief Kepley since Chief Kepley started as Chief for  
9 City of Palos Verdes Estates, Captain Best authenticated it was Chief Kepley in the  
10 radio interview. *See* PAMF 171, Best Depo. 149:5-11. A true and correct copy of  
11 Mr. Stoltze's July 17, 2015 radio interview of Chief Jeff Kepley is attached as  
12 Exhibit 18 to this declaration and is lodged with this Court by my co-counsel in this  
13 matter, Victor Otten. *See* Plaintiffs' Notice of Lodging.

14       27. After the filing of this lawsuit, CBS News produced a nationwide news  
15 story on Lunada Bay, led by correspondent Carter Evans. My co-counsel Victor  
16 Otten downloaded this story for use in this lawsuit, sharing it with my office. In the  
17 Carter Evans' story, at timestamp 2:47, a Palos Verdes Estates Police Officer is seen  
18 telling Mr. Evans and his crew: "We cannot send officers down there all the time,  
19 you know? But if something happens, you have a cell phone, too?" During the  
20 deposition of the City's PMK, Tony Best, who works with Sargent Luke Hellinga,  
21 Captain Best verified it is Sergeant Hellinga who is making the statement to Mr.  
22 Evans. A true and correct copy of this video, bates PLTF002055, is Exhibit 35 to  
23 this declaration and is lodged with the Court by my co-counsel in this matter, Victor  
24 Otten. *See* PAMF 171, Best Depo. 140:9-25, 141:1-3; *see also* Plaintiffs' Notice of  
25 Lodging.

26       28. My co-counsel Victor Otten obtained video of Officer Aaron Belda  
27 interacting with an event participant at Coastal Protection Rangers' 2017 Martin  
28

1 Luther King Jr., whom was intending to file a complaint about violation of the local  
2 surfing ordinance. In it, Officer Belda tells the event participant: "I'm not a surfer,  
3 so I don't understand surfing etiquette. And I don't even know what dropping in is."  
4 A true and correct copy of this video, bates PLTF002250, is Exhibit 36 to this  
5 declaration and is lodged with the Court. *See* PAMF 187, Best Depo. 130:23-25,  
6 131:1-3, 131:18-24; *see also* Plaintiffs' Notice of Lodging.

7       29. Attached hereto as Exhibit 19 is a true and correct copy of the Palos  
8 Verdes Estates Police Department Investigation Narrative (City Doc. 152).

9       30. Attached hereto as Exhibit 20 is a true and correct copy of the Palos  
10 Verdes Estates Police Department Office Report for Incident 16-00720 (City  
11 Doc. 185-187).

12       31. Attached hereto as Exhibit 21 is a true and correct copy of the  
13 "Summary of Palos Verdes Estates Administrative Investigation" marked  
14 "CONFIDENTIAL" (City Bates. Nos. CITY7087-CITY7096). *See also* Plaintiffs'  
15 Application for Leave to File Under Seal.

16       32. In reference to paragraph 21 above, on Thursday, July 27, 2017, with  
17 my partner Samantha Wolff, we called attorney Jacob Song who represents the City  
18 of Palos Verdes Estates, asking to meet and confer over our request that City  
19 document Nos. CITY7087-CITY7096 not be marked "CONFIDENTIAL" as we  
20 intended to use this in our opposition to the City's Motion for Summary Judgment  
21 and we did not believe it was properly marked. This Document is titled "Summary  
22 of Palos Verdes Estates Administrative Investigation" and is an external  
23 investigation of the planned-but-cancelled "compromised" investigation identified in  
24 the City's SSUF 82, which was set to take place on February 13, 2016 but "leaked"  
25 the day before. In it, a resident (and Bay Boy) is identified as persuading the City  
26 Manager to cancel the investigation the very next day. And it identifies potential  
27 internal and external sources of the "leak." Because the City's attorney did not get

1 back to us, we are submitting this document in conjunction with an Application for  
2 Leave to File Documents Under Seal, consistent with the parties' stipulated  
3 protective order. Plaintiffs do not believe the City has properly marked this  
4 "CONFIDENTIAL" and ask that this document be made public. *See also* Plaintiffs'  
5 Application for Leave to File Under Seal.

6       33. Attached hereto as Exhibit 22 is a true and correct copy of the City of  
7 Palos Verdes Estates and Chief of Police Jeff Kepley's Responses in Opposition to  
8 the Separate Statement of Undisputed [sic] Facts In Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for  
9 Class Certification [Docket No. 189].

10      34. Attached hereto as Exhibit 23 is a true and correct copy of the  
11 Declaration of Mark Slatten in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification  
12 [Docket No. 159-6].

13      35. Attached hereto as Exhibit 24 is a true and correct copy of the  
14 Declaration of Diana Milena Reed in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class  
15 Certification [Docket No. 159-5].

16      36. Attached hereto as Exhibit 25 is a true and correct copy of the  
17 Declaration of Cory Spencer in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification  
18 [Docket No. 159-4].

19      37. Attached hereto as Exhibit 26 is a true and correct copy of the Expert  
20 Declaration of Peter Neushul in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification  
21 [Docket No. 184-1].

22      38. Attached hereto as Exhibit 27 is a true and correct copy of the  
23 Declaration of Amin Akhavan in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class  
24 Certification [Docket No. 171].

25      39. Attached hereto as Exhibit 28 is a true and correct copy of the  
26 Declaration of Christopher Taloa in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class  
27 Certification [Docket No. 159-10].

1       40. Attached hereto as Exhibit 29 is a true and correct copy of the  
2 Declaration of Jordan Wright Spencer [sic] in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class  
3 Certification [Docket No. 159-9].

4       41. Attached hereto as Exhibit 30 is a true and correct copy of the  
5 Declaration of Ricardo G. Pastor in Support of Plaintiff's Motion for Class  
6 Certification [Docket No. 175].

7       42. Attached hereto as Exhibit 31 is a true and correct copy of the  
8 Declaration of Philip King in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification  
9 [Docket No. 184-2].

10      43. Attached hereto as Exhibit 32 is a true and correct copy of the  
11 Declaration of Philip King in Support of Plaintiffs' Opposition to Defendants City of  
12 Palos Verdes Estates and Chief of Police Jeff Kepley's Motion to Strike the  
13 Declaration of Philip King [Docket No. 216-1].

14      44. Attached hereto as Exhibit 33 is a true and correct copy of Defendant  
15 City of Palos Verdes Estates' Responses to Interrogatories Set One Propounded by  
16 Plaintiff Cory Spencer.

17      45. Two reporters from The Guardian recorded their interactions with local  
18 surfers at Lunada Bay, including Defendant Sang Lee, and Palos Verdes Estates  
19 Police Department Service Officer Catherine Placek. This video was reported by  
20 The Guardian, R. Carroll and N. Smith, on Monday, May 18, 2015, titled "Surfer  
21 turf wars in California: 'We'll burn you every single wave'" and was also produced  
22 in discovery by Plaintiffs at Bates PLTF002054. In the video, at 1:08 to 1:35 secs.,  
23 Service Officer Placek states: "We know all of them. They are infamous around  
24 here. They are pretty much grown men in little mens' mindset. They don't like  
25 anyone that's not one of the Bay Boys surfing down there. It literally is like a game  
26 with kids on a schoolyard to them. And they don't want you playing on their swing  
27 set. But, you know, it is what it is. If you feel uncomfortable, you know, then don't

1 do it." *See* PAMF 166. Placek's statements were authenticated by her in terms of  
2 substance, meaning, and intent. *See* PAMF 166, 171, 177 and 195. A true and  
3 correct copy of The Guardian, R. Carroll and N. Smith, Monday, May 18, 2015,  
4 "Surfer turf wars in California: 'We'll burn you every single wave'" is attached as  
5 Exhibit 37 and can also be found on The Guardian website at  
6 <https://www.theguardian.com/travel/video/2015/may/18/california-surf-wars-lunada-bay-localism-video>.  
7  
8

9 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of  
10 America that the foregoing is true and correct.

11 Executed on this 1st day of August, 2017, at San Francisco, California.  
12  
13 */s/ Kurt A. Franklin* \_\_\_\_\_  
14 Kurt A. Franklin  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28